

This chapter has discussed the changed relationship between unions, political parties, and states in "developing" economies. These might, more accurately, be referred to as economies facing chronic fiscal crises. The chapter paid close attention to the NCL in India and the PWC in Pakistan as illustrations of new forms of political unionism. It demonstrated that durable alliances between organized labor and political parties are no longer possible. Labor law is increasingly used to deny, rather than ensure, that workers' rights are respected. Organized labor's strategic opportunities have changed. Workers in India and in Pakistan are promoting new forms of political unionism to promote social justice and economic democracy. Indian labor federations have gained greater independence from political parties, forged alliances with social movements that represent the large and growing informal sector, and included subcontracted workers in collective bargaining agreements. In addition, Pakistani unions have gained greater political power through inter-federation solidarity. Since economic adjustment, national federations in Pakistan have united. Some have formed a labor party. In both countries, unions are becoming internally more democratic and are using public advocacy campaigns to secure workers' rights.

This comparative political economy study showed that democratic labor institutions and strong labor organizations play a role not only important to broadening the benefits of economic development but also vital to consolidating democracy. Specific kinds of labor institutions affected economic and political, outcomes in predictable and desirable ways.

## NOTES

### Introduction

- 1 W. Arthur Lewis, "Economic Development with Unlimited Supplies of Labour," *The Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies*, 22: 2, (May 1954), 155. Lewis was awarded the Nobel Prize in Economics in 1979.
- 2 Joseph Stiglitz makes this point and a case for government policies aimed at "providing full employment and better working conditions" (p. 10) in "Employment, Social Justice, and Societal Well-Being," *International Labour Review*, 141: 1-2, (2002), 9-29.
- 3 Here, I use the term "unions" in a broad sense, to refer to membership-based, employer-recognized organizations of workers as well as other kinds of workers' associations.
- 4 Rob Jenkins, *Democratic Politics and Economic Reform in India*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).
- 5 See further Christopher Candland, "Workers' Organizations in Pakistan: Why No Role in Formal Politics?" *Critical Asian Studies*, 39: 1, (March 2007), 35-57.
- 6 For more on the roots of Pakistan's unequal economic development patterns, see chapter two.
- 7 Whether the countries that are conventionally referred to as "developing" are developing, even in narrowly economic terms, is debatable. Thus, I avoid the phrase "developing countries." For further discussion on this see Oswaldo de Rivero, *The Myth of Development: the Non-viable Economies of the 21st Century*, (London: Zed, 2001).
- 8 In Pakistan, unions that have collective bargaining rights represent fewer than 2 percent of the non-agricultural labor force. Calculated from Government of Pakistan, Federal Bureau of Statistics, *Labour Force Survey* and Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Labour, Manpower, and Overseas Pakistanis, *Pakistan Labour Gazette: A Journal of Labour Affairs*. These are the most recent data in 2007. It is usual for South Asian labor publications to be published a few years after the year covered.
- 9 Chapter three discusses structural adjustment in detail.
- 10 Chapter two discusses economic policies before the IMF adjustment. Chapter four discusses labor trends, specifically the increasing vulnerability of workers that began before IMF adjustment.
- 11 See Alice Amsden, *The Rise of "The Rest": Challenges to the West from Late-Industrializing Economies*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003).
- 12 The military cut short both of Benazir Bhutto's terms and the first of Nawaz Sharif's terms in office - through the authority vested in the President, under the Eighth Constitutional Amendment. Among the reasons given for the dismissals was corruption at the highest levels of government. During Sharif's second term, his government removed the Amendment from the Constitution. Sharif's second term ended with General Pervez Musharraf's martial law declaration on October 12, 1999.

- 13 In India, there was lengthy experimentation with more managerial autonomy in public sector enterprises before the IMF programs. In Pakistan, there was no experimentation with managerial autonomy in public sector enterprises.
- 14 See Shaheed-ur-Rehman, *Who Owns Pakistan? Fluctuating Fortunes of Business Moghuls*, (Islamabad: Aekia Communications, n.d.).
- 15 Aristotle, "Metaphysics," Book II, Chapter 3, *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, ed., Richard McKeon, (New York: Random House, 1941), 715.
- 16 John Stuart Mill, *A System of Logic, Ratiocinative and Inductive Logic*, (London: Longmans, Green and Company, 1961, (1843)), 597.
- 17 Gunnar Myrdal, *Objectivity in Social Research*, (New York: Pantheon Books, 1969).
- 18 Reinhard Bendix, "The Mandate to Rule," *Social Forces*, 55: 2, (December 1976), 247.
- 19 Ayesha Jalal, *The Sole Spokesman: Jinnah and the Making of Pakistan*, (New York: Oxford, 1990).
- 20 See Maria Victoria Murillo, *Labor Unions, Partisan Coalitions, and Market Reforms in Latin America*, (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2001). A summary appears as Maria Victoria Murillo, "Partisan Loyalty and Union Competition: Macroeconomic Adjustment and Industrial Restructuring in Mexico," in Christopher Candland and Rudra Sil, eds, *The Politics of Labor in a Global Age: Continuity and Change in Late-industrializing and Post-socialist Economies*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 31–68.

#### Organized labor and democratic consolidation

- 1 G. V. Joshi, *Writings and Speeches of G.V. Joshi*, (Poona: Aryabhushan Press, 1912), 743. Cited in Bipan Chandra, *The Rise and Growth of Economic Nationalism in India*, (New Delhi: People's Publishing House, 1966), 113. G. V. Joshi was an Indian Civil Service officer and a mentor to prominent Indian industrialists.
- 2 See David Morris, *The Emergence of an Industrial Labor Force in India: A Study of the Bombay Cotton Mills, 1854–1947*, (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1965) and J. H. Boeke, *Economics and Economic Policy of Dual Societies*, (New York: Institute of Pacific Relations, 1953).
- 3 A serious discussion on the views of even the major Marxist political parties of the state is a book-length exercise. Baldev Raj Nayar's discussion of the differing perspective of the role of the state in Indian society held by India's two leading communist parties – the Communist Party of India and the Communist Party of India (Marxist) – is almost book length. See "Contending Approaches to the State and Public Sector," *India's Mixed Economy: The Role of Ideology and Interest in Its Development*, (Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1989), 62–127.
- 4 Harry Blair, "Mrs. Gandhi's Emergency, The Indian Elections of 1977, Pluralism and Marxism: Problems with Paradigms," *Modern Asian Studies*, 14: 2, (1980), 269.
- 5 Pranab Bardhan, *The Political Economy of Development in India*, (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1984).
- 6 Tariq Ali provides an insightful discussion of the pivotal role of the military in Pakistan in "The Colour Khaki," *New Left Review*, 19, (January–February 2003).
- 7 Hamza Alavi, "The State in Postcolonial Societies: Pakistan and Bangladesh," in Kathleen Gough and Hari Sharma, eds, *Imperialism and Revolution in South Asia*, (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1973), 145–73. When Alavi wrote of a bureaucratic-military oligarchy, he referred not to the state, the governmental apparatus, but to a regime, the institutionalized practices of government.
- 8 Quotations from Alavi, "Class and State," *Pakistan: The Roots of Dictatorship*, (London: Zed Books, 1983), 60 and 65, respectively.

- 9 According to Alavi, the Indian National Congress took control of the colonial state in the interest of the domestic bourgeoisie, explaining the Indian state's relatively constrained autonomy.
- 10 One of the strengths of Alavi's analysis is its explicit comparative framework.
- 11 V. B. Karnik, *Indian Trade Unions: A Survey*, (Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1978), 1–14.
- 12 Bakhtiar and his place in the Pakistani labor movement are discussed in greater detail below.
- 13 See Ranajit Das Gupta, "Social Security and Mutual Assistance in India: A Preliminary Account," *International Social Security Review*, 46: 3, (1993), 53–68.
- 14 Karnik, *Indian Trade Unions*, 4–9.
- 15 P. P. Arya, *Trade Unions in India: Growth and Recognition*, (New Delhi: Deep and Deep Publications, 1985), 12.
- 16 Tanika Sarkar, *Bengal 1928–1934, the Politics of Protest*, (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1987).
- 17 B. N. Datar, "Ideology and Trade Unions – Indian Experience," *V. B. Karnik Memorial Lectures*, (Bombay: Maharashtra Institute of Labour Studies, April, 1987), 24.
- 18 *Ibid.*, 25.
- 19 Cited in *ibid.*
- 20 See G. Kotovsky, "The Origins and Development of the Communist and Workers' Movement in India, with Focus on the CPI," in Berch Berberoglu, ed., *Class, State and Development in India*, (New Delhi: Sage, 1992), 248.
- 21 Zafar Shaheed, "The Organisation and Leadership of Industrial Labour in Pakistan (Karachi)," unpublished PhD dissertation, Department of Politics, University of Leeds, 1977, 121.
- 22 Dick Kooiman, *Bombay Textile Labour: Managers, Trade Unionists and Officials 1918–1939*, (New Delhi: Manohar, 1989), 33.
- 23 Shaheed, "The Organisation and Leadership of Industrial Labour in Pakistan," 122.
- 24 Khizar Humayan Ansari, "Roots of Muslim Socialist Activity and Labour Organization in Pre-Partition India," paper presented at the Conference on Labour in Pakistan, Karachi, December 26–28, 1999, 4.
- 25 *Ibid.*, 7.
- 26 Shaheed, "The Organisation and Leadership of Industrial Labour in Pakistan," 108.
- 27 The relevant section of the Indian Penal Code is found in Government of India, Ministry of Labour, *Indian Labour Year Book 1947–48*, (New Delhi: Labour Bureau, 1948).
- 28 *Indian Labour Yearbook 1946–1947*, 122. Cited in Prafulla Chandra Das, *Trade Unions and Politics in India: A Study of Orissa*, (New Delhi: Discovery Publishing House, 1990), 142.
- 29 Martin Waiwright, "The Development of India's Defense Industries during the Second World War: Implications for the Partition of the Subcontinent," paper presented at the Association for Asian Studies, 6 April 1990.
- 30 K.P. Chakravarti, *Law of Industrial Disputes*, (Calcutta: Eastern Law House, 1987), 7.
- 31 The Indian National Trade Union Congress leader Jagjivan Ram claimed that 90 percent of the seats reserved for labor in the 1937 elections went to Congress. Shachi Rani Gurtu, ed., *Jagjivan Ram on Labour Problems*, (Delhi: Atma Ram and Sons, 1951), 14. In fact, 90 percent of the 20 seats that Congress contested went to the Congress.
- 32 *Indian Labour Gazette*, (Simla: Labour Bureau, September 1946), 89.
- 33 G. Ramanujam, *Indian Labour Movement*, (New Delhi: Sterling Publishers, 1990), 19.
- 34 B. N. Datar, "Ideology and Trade Unions – Indian Experience."

- 35 Jawaharlal Nehru, *An Autobiography*, (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1989, (1936)), 186-87.
- 36 Kotovsky, "The Origins and Development of the Communist and Workers' Movement in India," 250.
- 37 Mohandas Gandhi, *Collected Works*, vol. 14, 232-34, as quoted by Judith Brown, *Gandhi: Prisoner of Hope*, (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1989), 121 and 122. Cited in Lloyd Rudolph and Susanne Hoeber Rudolph, "Dependent Labor and the Politics of Economic Reform in India: Left and Right Protectionism in the Nineties," paper presented at the University of California-Harvard University Workshop on Political Parties and Working Class Constituencies, April 25, 1999, 4.
- 38 For a detailed account of the strike, see Judith Brown, *Gandhi's Rise to Power: Indian Politics 1915-1922*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1972), 118-122.
- 39 The Self-Employed Women's Association (SEWA) emerged from the Textile Labour Association. Ela Bhatt founded SEWA shortly after being expelled from the Textile Labour Association, where she served as Vice President. SEWA, discussed in chapter five, is one of today's most significant trade unions in India.
- 40 G. Ramanaujam, *The Honey Bee: Toward a New Culture in Industrial Relations*, (New Delhi: Sterling Publishers, 1985), 103.
- 41 Textile Labour Association, "In the Service of Women," (Ahmedabad: Gandhi Majdoor Sevalaya, 1986), 3.
- 42 Resolution cited by Jagjivan Ram, "Congress and the Workers," in Shachi Rani Gurtu, ed., *Jagjivan Ram on Labour Problems*, (Delhi: Atma Ram and Sons, 1951), 13. Jagjivan Ram was independent India's first Labour Minister.
- 43 *Ibid.*, 14.
- 44 *Ibid.*, 12-17.
- 45 These are Directive Principles 41 through 43. Government of India, *The Constitution of India*, (New Delhi: B. V. P. Press, 1956), 26.
- 46 For a study of the role of unionists in electoral politics in Orissa, see Prafulla Chandra Das, *Trade Union and Politics in India: A Study of Orissa*.
- 47 Ajeet Mathur, Professor of Personnel Management and Industrial Relations, Indian Institute of Management, Calcutta, interview with author, December 30, 1991.
- 48 E. A. Ramaswamy, "A Chastened Trade Unionism," *Business India*, 15th Anniversary Issue, 1993, 161.
- 49 Rudolph and Rudolph, *In Pursuit of Lakshmi: The Political Economy of the Indian State*, (Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press, 1985), 260.
- 50 Clifford Geertz, *Agricultural Involvement: The Process of Ecological Change in Indonesia*, (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1970). Rudolph and Rudolph, *In Pursuit of Lakshmi*, 269.
- 51 Kamal Muzumdar, a former ILO Director and a senior Indian trade union official with the Indian National Trade Union Congress, argues that the best thing that the Indian trade union centers could do for the labor movement is to disband. Kamal Muzumdar, interview with author, New Delhi, November 28, 1991.
- 52 Rashid Amjad and Khalid Mahmood, "Industrial Relations and the Political Process in Pakistan, 1947-1977" and Shaheed, "The Organisation and Leadership of Industrial Labour in Pakistan (Karachi)."
- 53 Karamat Ali (Multan), "Labour Legislation and Trade Unions," mimeograph, no date.
- 54 *Ibid.*, 4.

- 55 See Stanley Kochanek, *Interest Groups and Development Business and Politics in Pakistan*, (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1983), 69.
- 56 Khurshid Alam, General Secretary of Bata Mazdoor League Pakistan, interview with author, Lahore, September 4, 1992. Alam has been involved in the trade union movement since 1940.
- 57 Gulzar Ahmad Chaudhary, General Secretary of All Pakistan Trade Union Federation, interview with author, Lahore, September 5, 1992.
- 58 Bashir Ahmed Bakhtiar, *Mazdoor Tehriq aur Mai*, ("The Labor Movement and Me"), (Lahore: West Pakistan Hydro Electric Central Labour Union, 1962).
- 59 Ashraf Ali, "Trade Unions in Pakistan," mimeograph, 1991, 6.
- 60 Shaheed, "Union Leaders, Work Organization and Strikes: Karachi 1969-72," *Development and Change*, 10, (1979), 181-204, 185.
- 61 Badiuddin A. Khan, "The Myth of Labour Policy," *Industrial Relations Journal*, 9: 3, (May-June 1992), 29-33, 30.
- 62 Shaheed, "Union Leaders, Work Organization and Strikes," 185.
- 63 Iqbal Haidari, ed., *The New Labour Policy: Impact and Implications*, (Karachi: Economic and Industrial Publications, 1972), 165. Haidari describes Malik's policy as paternalistic, based on the lines of Japanese labor policy, presumably referring to enterprise unionism.
- 64 Riffat Hussain, labor organizer, interview with author, Rawalpindi, September 12, 1992.
- 65 Khan, "The Myth of Labour Policy," 30.
- 66 Gulzar Ahmad Chaudhary, interview with author, Multan September 5, 1992.
- 67 Note that this is not Khurshid Ahmed, General Secretary of All Pakistan Federation of Trade Unions and General Secretary of Water and Power Development Authority (WAPDA)'s State Hydro-Electric Union (SHEU).
- 68 Kiernan, "A Note on the Author," *Poems by Faiz*, (Lahore: Vanguard Books, 1971), 7.
- 69 Ali, "Trade Unions in Pakistan."
- 70 Shaheed, "Union Leaders, Work Organization and Strikes," 186.
- 71 *Ibid.*
- 72 Shaheed has documented the crucial role of workplace leaders and workers' communities in the strike wave of 1963. See Shaheed, "The Organisation and Leadership of Industrial Labour in Pakistan (Karachi)."
- 73 "Tributes Paid to Martyrs of March, 1963," paper unknown, clipping in *Dawn* (Karachi) library, March 3, 1969.
- 74 Shaheed, "Union Leaders, Work Organization and Strikes," 188.
- 75 Usman Baloch, former President of the Muttahida Mazdoor Federation, interview with author, Karachi, September 27, 1992.
- 76 Riffat Hussain interview with author, Rawalpindi, September 12, 1992.
- 77 Usman Baloch, interview with author, Karachi, September 27, 1992.
- 78 "Labour Body Conference Held," *Morning News*, February 1, 1969.
- 79 Riffat Hussain, interview with author, Rawalpindi, September 24, 1992.
- 80 "Workers' Processions, Meetings," *Morning News*, February 24, 1969.
- 81 "Labour Federations Support Friday's General Strike Call," February 13, 1969.
- 82 "Workers Walk Out of Joint Council Meeting," *Morning News*, February 22, 1969.
- 83 Khurshid Ahmed, General Secretary of All Pakistan Federation of Trade Unions, interview with author, Lahore, 3 September 1992.
- 84 Interviews of author with Maher Mohammad Akram, President, and Syed Akhter Hussain Shah, Deputy General Secretary, Colony Textile Mills Labour Union, Multan, September 24, 1992. Also "6 Workers Hurt in Firing by Multan Mills' Watchmen," *Dawn*, March 18, 1969.

- 85 "Labour Unrest," *Morning News*, March 7, 1969.
- 86 "Fair Wages, Right of Strike for Labourers," *Dawn*, April 26, 1969.
- 87 Noor Khan, interview with author, Karachi, March 28 and 29, 1995.
- 88 "Government Urged to Announce Revised Labour Policy Soon," *Dawn*, July 1, 1969.
- 89 The Industrial Relations Ordinance of 1969 repealed four pieces of labor law, two acts passed by the Constitutional Assembly and two martial law ordinances. The annulled labor laws were the East Pakistan Trade Unions Act of 1965, the East Pakistan Labour Disputes Act of 1965, the West Pakistan Industrial Disputes Ordinance of 1968 and the West Pakistan Trade Unions Ordinance of 1968.
- 90 On record for their support are the APCOL (M. A. Khatib), the APFL (Rehmatullah Khan Durrani), the West Pakistan Textile Mills Employees Federation (Akhtar Husain Kiyani), and the West Pakistan Textile Mills Mazdoor Union (Ghulam Husain). "New Labour Policy Hailed," *Dawn*, July 8, 1969.
- 91 "Industrial Unrest," *The Pakistan Times*, 15 November 1969.
- 92 *Daily News*, November 15, 1969.
- 93 "Protest Rallies by Valika Mill Workers," *Dawn*, November 1, 1969.
- 94 Faizullah Khan, President, Valika Textile and Woolen Mills Workers Union, interview with author, Karachi, August 31, 1992.
- 95 "40 Trade Unions Back Striking Workers," *Dawn*, 6 November 1969.
- 96 "Kaniz Fatma in City," *Dawn*, November 20, 1969.
- 97 "13 Labourers convicted by ML Court in Karachi," *Political Observer*, November 19, 1969.
- 98 Maleeha Lodhi, 'Bhutto, the Pakistan Peoples Party and Political Development in Pakistan, 1967-1977', unpublished PhD thesis, London School of Economics and Political Science, University of London, 1980, 130.
- 99 Manzoor Ahmed, interview with author, September 27, 1992.
- 100 "Bhutto's Speech at Labour Moot: Text," *Dawn*, November 22, 1973.
- 101 Riffat Hussain, interview with author, Rawalpindi, September 9, 1992.
- 102 For fair trade Union perspectives on the policy, see Haidari, *The New Labour Policy: Impact and Implications*, 1972.
- 103 Ali, "Trade Unions in Pakistan", 103.
- 104 Mustafa Pasha, conversation with author, February 25, 1995.
- 105 US Department of Labor, *Foreign Labor Trends: Pakistan*, (Washington, DC: US Government Printing Office, 1990).
- 106 Haider Zaman, human resource management consultant to the 1979 and 1986 Labour Commissions of Pakistan, Karachi, interview with author, August 26, 1992.
- 107 Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, *State of Human Rights in Pakistan 1990*, Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, 1990, 49.
- 108 Haider Zaman, Karachi, interview with author, August 26, 1992.
- 109 International Labour Office, "Pakistan: Developing a Labour Policy," *Social and Labour Bulletin*, (June 1992), 146-48.
- 110 British Broadcasting Corporation, Summary of World Broadcasts, "Ban on Railway Workers Lifted," *Radio Pakistan External Service*, 11:00 GMT, May 2, 1995.
- 111 Left federations have been on record accusing the APFTU of opportunism and of being too willing to enter into agreements with whichever government may be in power. When the APFTU remained in talks with government (which resulted in the 1992 announcement of a new minimum wage for unskilled workers) after all other federations walked out, other federations made the accusation. The APFTU and Kurshid Ahmed, General Secretary since 1972, also receive extensive coverage in the English-language press, while other federations and their leaders are rarely discussed by the press.

- 112 Ruth Berins Collier and David Collier, *Shaping the Political Arena: Critical Junctures, the Labor Movement and Regime Dynamics in Latin America*, (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991).
- 113 For details, see Hasan Zaher, "The Communist Connection," *The Times and Trial of the Rawalpindi Conspiracy 1951*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1998, 204-23).
- 114 Jalal, Ayesha, *The State of Martial Law: The Origins of Pakistan's Political Economy of Defence*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 295.
- 115 Article 21, Section 3 of Industrial Relations Ordinance of 1969.
- 116 For state-level analysis in India, see Christopher Candland, "Labor Institutions and Industrial Restructuring in India," (College Park, MD: Center on Institutional Reform and the Informal Sector, India Working Paper, no. 24, 1996).
- 117 Chapter four discusses the textile industry, the RMMS, the Bombay textile strike, and Datta Samant.

### The state and economic development

- 1 Letter from President of the All India Muslim League to Jawaharlal Nehru, President, Indian National Congress, March 8, 1938, in Syed Sharifuddin Pirzada, ed., *Quaid-e-Azam Jinnah's Correspondence*, third revised and enlarged edition, (Karachi: East and West Publishing Company, 1977), 254.
- 2 Letter in reply to Mohammad Ali Jinnah, April 6, 1938, in Pirzada, op. cit., 260.
- 3 Cited by Istaqbal Mehdi (former Pakistan Minister of Production), "State Intervention and Public Enterprises in the Market Place - Some Issues and Problems with Special Reference to Pakistan," manuscript, n.d., 4.
- 4 Mahbub ul Haq first spoke of the "22 families" in a talk to the Applied Economics Research Centre of the University of Karachi in 1968.
- 5 Emajuddin Ahmed, *Bureaucratic Elites in Segmented Economic Growth: Pakistan and Bangladesh*, (Dacca: University Press, 1980), 87.
- 6 Government of India, "The Industrial Policy Resolution," (Simla: Government of India Press, 1956).
- 7 Bharat Bhushan Gupta, *The Welfare State in India: Theory and Practice*, (Allahabad: Central Book Depot, 1966), 35.
- 8 Ibid., 47. There was in the 1950s and 1960s considerable academic work on the Indian "welfare state" in Indian universities and much official literature on the development of the Indian welfare state as well. See, for example, P. D. Gupta, *Welfare State in India*, (Agra: Agra University, 1955) and Government of India, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, *Road to Welfare State*, (Delhi: Government of India, May 1957).
- 9 All figures in this and the next paragraph, unless otherwise noted, are for 1999 in India and 1998 in Pakistan. See United Nations Development Programme, table 15, "Inequality in Income and Consumption," *Human Development Report 2005*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), 272.
- 10 On the impact of Gulf migration on Pakistan see Jonathan Addleton, *Undermining the Centre: The Gulf Migration and Pakistan*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1992).
- 11 Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Finance, *Pakistan Economic Survey 1990*, (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan Printing Press, 1991).
- 12 Government of India, Ministry of Finance, *Economic Survey 1990-91*, (New Delhi: Government of India Press, 1991), S-9.
- 13 See United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report 2005*, table 20, "Priorities in Public Spending," 286-87.

- 14 A. R. Kemal, "Privatisation: The Experience of Pakistan," in V. Kanesalingam, ed., *Privatisation: Trends and Experiences in South Asia*, (New Delhi: MacMillan India, 1991), 132. Figures are presumably those current at the time of writing in 1991, prior to much fiscal adjustment and industrial restructuring.
- 15 *Ibid.*, 139.
- 16 World Bank, "Pakistan: Country Economic Memorandum FY93: Progress Under the Adjustment Program," (Washington, DC: World Bank, March 23, 1993), 49.
- 17 The politically significant issue of industrial "sickness" and its relationship to job protection and employment is discussed in chapter three.
- 18 See Public Interest Research Group, "Structural Adjustment: Who Really Pays?," (Delhi: Public Interest Research Group, 1992), 36.
- 19 M. S. Narayanan, "Trading Charges," *Economic Times*, May 19, 1991.
- 20 Naoroji first articulated his "drain theory" in 1871, in a paper titled "Commerce of India." The theory is more fully worked out in *Poverty and Unbritish Rule in India*, (London: S. Sonnenschein, 1901). Rajani Palme Dutt argued that England had de-industrialized India. See Dutt, *The Problem of India*, (New York: International Publishers, 1943) and *India To-day*, (London: V. Gollancz, 1940). Brook Adams, *The Law of Civilization and Decay*, (London: Sonnenschein, 1895), 259-60 argues that England's industrial revolution was financed by India's plunder.
- 21 Hassan Gardezi, "Neocolonial Alliances and the Crisis of Pakistan," in Kathleen Gough and Hari Sharma, eds, *Imperialism and Revolution in South Asia*, (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1973), 130-44, 134. Also see Bipan Chandra, *The Rise and Growth of Economic Nationalism in India*, (New Delhi: People's Publishing House, 1966).
- 22 See Clive Dewey, ed., *Arrested Development in India*, (Riverdale, MD: Riverdale Company, 1988), especially Specker, "'De-Industrialization' in Nineteenth Century India: The Textile Industry in the Madras Presidency, 1810-70," 333-46.
- 23 Specker, "'De-Industrialization' in Nineteenth Century India," 333. David Morris sought to challenge the de-industrialization thesis, arguing that statistical evidence was inadequate, that a rise in domestic demand could have absorbed the growing imports, and that the import of mill yarn strengthened the position of the Indian weaver. See Morris, "Toward a Reinterpretation of Nineteenth Century Indian Economic History," *Indian Economic and Social History Review*, 5, (1968).
- 24 Jawaharlal Nehru, *The Discovery of India*, (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1992, (1946)), 505.
- 25 *Ibid.*, 505-7.
- 26 Chatterjee, *Nationalist Thought and the Colonial World*, (London: Zed Books, 1986), 132.
- 27 Nehru, *Discovery of India*, 524-36.
- 28 *Ibid.*, 266.
- 29 See B. N. Datar, "Idcology and Trade Unions - Indian Experience," *V. B. Karnik Memorial Lectures*, (Bombay: Maharashtra Institute of Labour Studies, April, 1987), 39.
- 30 Nehru, *An Autobiography*, (New Delhi: Oxford University Press), 267.
- 31 For an elaboration of this point, see Raghavendra Chattopadhyay, "Indian Business and Economic Planning (1930-56)," in Dwijendra Tripathi, ed., *Business and Politics in India: A Historical Perspective*, (Delhi: Manohar, 1991), 308-50.
- 32 *Ibid.*, 308.
- 33 The speech was published as G. D. Birla, "Indian Prosperity: A Plea for Planning," and delivered at the annual session of the Federation of Indian Chamber of Commerce and Industry, 1934.

- 34 Bipan Chandra, "Jawaharlal Nehru and the Capitalist Class, 1936," in *Nationalism and Colonialism in Modern India*, (New Delhi: Orient Longman, 1979), 171-203.
- 35 Thakurdas sat on government commissions and corporate boards and was later knighted. J. R. D. Tata was then manager of Tata Iron and Steel Company, Chairman of Tata and Sons and chairman or director of over a dozen other companies. G. D. Birla was a successful textile mill owner, a merchant, Managing Director of the vast Birla Brothers industries, and founder, in 1927, with Thakurdas, of the Federation of Indian Chambers of Commerce and Industry. Dalal was a director and partner of the Tata Sons industrial empire and a government officer. Shri Ram was a mill owner and landlord. Shroff was a stockbroker and businessman. John Matthai was a professor of economics and Director General of Commercial Intelligence and Statistics. Each was associated with the Indian National Congress. *Who's Who in India, Burma and Ceylon, 1941-42*, (Bombay: Who's Who Publishers, 1942). Purshotamdas Thakurdas, J. R. D. Tata, G. D. Birla, Ardeshir Dalal, Shri Ram, Kasturbhai Lalbhai, A. D. Shroff, and John Matthai, *Brief Memorandum Outlining a Plan of Economic Development for India*, (Bombay: The Commercial Printing Press, part 1, January, 1944, part 2, January, 1945).
- 36 *Ibid.*, 48.
- 37 *Ibid.*, 3.
- 38 K. B. Krishna, *Plan for Economic Development of India: A Critical and Historical Survey*, (Bombay: Padma Publications, 1945).
- 39 Ayesha Jalal, *The State of Martial Rule: The Origins of Pakistan's Political Economy of Defence*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 9.
- 40 G. Allana, ed., *Pakistan Movement: Historic Documents*, (Karachi: Department of International Relations, University of Karachi, 1967), 7-10. Cited in Stanley Wolpert, *Jinnah of Pakistan*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1984), 22.
- 41 Wolpert, *Jinnah of Pakistan*, 29.
- 42 Syed Sharifuddin Pirzada, ed., *Foundations of Pakistan: The All-India Muslim League Documents: 1906-1947*, volume III, (1906-47), (Karachi: National Publishing House, 1970).
- 43 Gardezi, "Neocolonial Alliances and the Crisis of Pakistan," 137.
- 44 *Ibid.*
- 45 Pirzada, *Foundations of Pakistan*, 19.
- 46 *Ibid.*, 99.
- 47 Ian Talbot, "Planning for Pakistan: The Planning Committee of the All-India Muslim League 1943-46," *Modern Asian Studies*, 28: 4, (1994), 875-89. Also see Khalid Shamsul Hasan, ed., *Quaid-i-Azam's Unrealized Dream: Formation and Working of the All India Muslim League Economics Planning Committee with Background Material and Notes*, (Shamsul Hasa Foundation for Historical Studies and Research, 1991).
- 48 The commitment to a "socialist pattern of development" was made in the Industrial Policy resolution of 1956.
- 49 Nehru, *An Autobiography*, (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1989, (1936)), 163, 182-83.
- 50 Niraja Gopal Jayal, "Introduction," in Sidney Webb and Beatrice Webb, *Indian Diary*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990), x-xi. For important Fabian tracts see Sidney Webb, *The Necessary Basis of Society*, (London: Westminster, 1911) and G. Bernard Shaw, Sidney Webb, William Clarke, Sydney Oliver, Annie Besant, Graham Wallas, and Hubert Bland, *Fabian Essays in Socialism*,

- (London: The Fabian Society, 1889). On the role of central planning in Fabian thinking, see John Callaghan, "Fabian Socialism, Democracy and the State," in Graeme Duncan, ed., *Democracy and the Capitalist State*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), 159-80.
- 51 Sukhamoy Chakravarty, *Development Planning: The Indian Experience*, (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1987), 9-11.
- 52 Ibid., 10.
- 53 Ibid.
- 54 Chakravarty, "Nehru and Indian Planning," *South Asian Research*, 9: 2, (November 1989), 95.
- 55 Industrial Policy Resolution, 3.
- 56 George Rosen, *Democracy and Economic Change in India*, (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1966), 91-92.
- 57 Government of India, Planning Commission, *Papers Relating to the Formation of the Second Five-Year Plan*, (New Delhi: Government Printing Press, 1955). Cited in Rosen, *Democracy and Economic Change in India*, 126.
- 58 First Five-Year Plan, cited by H. P. Khare, *Current Trends in Indian Trade Union Movement: A Study of White-Collar Trade Unions*, (Allahabad: Chugh Publications, 1987), 203. Khare's work is a study of the Allahabad Textile Labour Association.
- 59 Ibid.
- 60 Baldev Raj Nayar, *India's Mixed Economy: The Role of Ideology and Interest in its Development*, (Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1989), 249.
- 61 I use the term "Third World" as Jawaharlal Nehru, Abdul Nasser, Mohammad Sukarno, and Chou Enlai did at the Africa-Asia Unity Conference in Bandung, Indonesia in 1955. They referred to the Third World as that alliance of countries that could carve out a way between the inequalities of market dominated societies, specifically that of the United States, and the abuse of political liberties in state dominated societies, specifically that of the Soviet Union.
- 62 Nayar, 249-52.
- 63 Ibid., 254, 261.
- 64 Angus Maddison, *Class Structure and Economic Growth: India and Pakistan since the Moghuls*, (New York: W. W. Norton, 1971).
- 65 Kuldip Nayar, *India: The Critical Years*, (Delhi: Vikas Publishing, 1971), 29. Cited in Nayar, *India's Mixed Economy*, 262.
- 66 Ibid., 253-56.
- 67 Ibid., 262.
- 68 Life insurance had been nationalized in 1956.
- 69 Nayar, *India's Mixed Economy*, 273.
- 70 (O) stands for Organisation.
- 71 Ibid., 265.
- 72 Later to become Congress (I).
- 73 Nayar, *India's Mixed Economy*, 283-84.
- 74 Government of India, *Economic Survey 1978-79*, (New Delhi: Ministry of Finance, 1979), appendix.
- 75 Nayar, *India's Mixed Economy*, 332.
- 76 Mrs. Gandhi was found guilty of using government officials to erect and supply electricity to speaker stands in her constituency. Henry Hart, ed., *Indira Gandhi's India: A Political System Reappraised*, (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1976), 3.
- 77 Andrew Davenport, "Indira's Industrial Balancing Act," *Far Eastern Economic Review*, August 22, 1975, 55-56.

- 78 Ibid. Also see Ashok Bhargava and Gopalan Balachandran, "Economic Change During the Indian Emergency," *Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars*, 9: 4, (October-December 1977), 50-58.
- 79 Guillermo O'Donnell, *Modernization and Bureaucratic Authoritarianism: Studies in South American Politics*, (Berkeley, CA: Institute for International Studies, 1973), 85.
- 80 Ibid., 57-58.
- 81 Lloyd Rudolph and Susanne Hoeber Rudolph, *In Pursuit of Lakshmi: The Political Economy of the Indian State*, (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1985), 88.
- 82 Government of Pakistan, Planning Commission, *The Sixth Five-Year Plan, 1983-88*, (Islamabad: Planning Commission, 1983), 1.
- 83 Ayesha Jalal, *The State of Martial Rule*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 33.
- 84 Maddison, *Class Structure and Economic Growth*, 158. See Papanek, *Pakistan's Development*, 40-46 for details on trading communities and Pakistan's early entrepreneurs.
- 85 Maddison, *Class Structure and Economic Growth*, 139.
- 86 Ibid.
- 87 Jalal, *The State of Martial Law*, 32-37.
- 88 Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Finance, *Fiscal Policy in Pakistan - A Historical Perspective*, Volume one, (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan Printing Press, 1972), 71. Cited in Viqar Ahmed and Rashid Amjad, *The Management of Pakistan's Political Economy, 1947-82*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1984), 68-69.
- 89 Omar Noman, *The Political Economy of Pakistan 1947-85*, (New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1988), 15.
- 90 Maddison, *Class Structure and Economic Growth*, 139.
- 91 Emajuddin Ahmed, *Bureaucratic Elites in Segmented Economic Growth: Pakistan and Bangladesh*, (Dacca: University Press, 1980), 87.
- 92 Government of Pakistan, *Pakistan Statistical Yearbook*, (Islamabad: Pakistan Government Printing Press, 1964), 163 and Papanek, *Pakistan's Development*, 7. Cited in Gardezi, "Neocolonial Alliances and the Crisis of Pakistan," 139.
- 93 Tariq Ali, *Can Pakistan Survive? The Death of a State*, (London: Verso, 1983), 62.
- 94 Habibur Rahman, *Growth Models and Pakistan: A Discussion of Planning Problems*, (Karachi: The Allied Book Company, 1962), 5.
- 95 US economists working as advisors to the Planning Commission included David Bell, Gustav Papanek, Emile Despres, Lionel Hanson, and Richard Mallon. Gardezi claims that there were thousands of US professionals in Pakistan, "Neocolonial Alliances and the Crisis of Pakistan," 139, citing Embassy of Pakistan, *Pakistan's Third Five-Year Plan, 1965-70*, Interim Report Series, December 1969, 2.
- 96 Albert Waterston, *Planning in Pakistan*, (Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1963). Waterston was an advisor to the Planning Commission who has detailed its administration by American experts.
- 97 Ahmed and Amjad, *The Management of Pakistan's Political Economy*, 11.
- 98 Huntington, *Political Order in Changing Societies*, 253.
- 99 Ayub Khan was later forced to accept the legalization of political parties.
- 100 Huntington, *Political Order in Changing Societies*, 251.
- 101 Ahmed and Amjad, *The Management of Pakistan's Political Economy*, 13-14.
- 102 Maddison, *Class Structure and Economic Growth*, 136-63.
- 103 Akmal Hussain, *Strategic Issues in Pakistan's Economic Policy*, (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1988), 367-73.
- 104 Rahman, *Growth Models and Pakistan*, 1962.

- 105 Ibid., 70.
- 106 W. Arthur Lewis first published his model as "Economic development with unlimited supplies of labour," *Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies*, 22: 2, (May 1954), 139-91, and later published it in *The Theory of Economic Growth*, (London: Allen and Unwin, 1955).
- 107 Lewis, "Economic development with unlimited supplies of labour," 189.
- 108 Rahman, *Growth Models and Pakistan*, 72.
- 109 Ibid., 69.
- 110 Mahbub ul Haq, *The Strategy of Economic Planning*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1963), 1-3.
- 111 Papanek, *Pakistan's Development*.
- 112 The phrase is the title of the concluding chapter of Papanek's book.
- 113 Adams and Iqbal, *Exports, Politics, and Economic Development: Pakistan 1970-82*, (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1983).
- 114 Ahmed and Amjad, *The Management of Pakistan's Political Economy*, 11.
- 115 Mahbub ul Haq, "A Critical Review of the Third Five Year Plan," in M. A. Khan, ed., *Management and National Growth*, (Karachi: West Pakistan Management Association, 1968), 27. Cited and quoted in Maddison, *Class Structure and Economic Growth*, 158. Mahbub ul Haq's widely cited claim was originally made in a lecture in Karachi in 1968.
- 116 On the negative consequences of economic concentration under Ayub, see Keith Griffin and Azizur Rahman Khan, eds, *Growth and Inequality in Pakistan*, (London: Macmillan, 1972), Stephen Lewis, *Economic Policy and Industrial Growth in Pakistan*, (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1969), and *Pakistan: Industrialization and Trade Policies*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1970).
- 117 Huntington, *Political Order in Changing Societies*, 261.
- 118 For analyses of the composition of the movement against the Ayub Khan regime, see Muncer Ahmed, "The November Mass Movement in Pakistan," in *Aspects of Pakistan's Politics and Administration*, (Lahore: University of the Punjab, 1974) and Shahid Javed Burki, "Ayub's Fall: A Socioeconomic Explanation," *Asian Survey*, 12: 3, (March 1972), 201-12.
- 119 Adams and Iqbal, *Exports, Politics, and Economic Development*.
- 120 Mohammad Anwar Syed, *The Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*, (London: Macmillan, 1992), 26.
- 121 See Mohammad Ashgar Khan, *The First Round*, (Lahore: Taabeer Publishing House, 1978), 113. For an appraisal of Bhutto's role and motivations in the 1965 war see Anwar Syed, "Bhutto and the War of 1965: An Assessment," in Syed, *Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*, 47-55.
- 122 Ibid., 47.
- 123 Ibid., 51-54.
- 124 "(A)llegedly under American pressure" reports Syed. Ibid., 54.
- 125 Maleeha Lodhi, "Bhutto, the Pakistan Peoples Party and Political Development in Pakistan, 1967-77", unpublished PhD dissertation, London School of Economics and Political Science, University of London, 1980.
- 126 Pakistan Peoples Party, *Foundation Documents of the Pakistan Peoples Party*, (Lahore, November, 1967).
- 127 Syed, *Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*, 62.
- 128 Pakistan Peoples Party, "Election Manifesto of the Pakistan Peoples Party," (Lahore: Classic, 1970).
- 129 Syed, *Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*, 65. Quotation cited therein.

- 130 Elections had been held in 1955 to constitute a new Constitutional Assembly. The Assembly was converted into a short-lived National Asscembly by the 1956 Constitution, and dismissed under martial law in 1958.
- 131 Syed, *Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*, 117.
- 132 Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, *Speeches and Statements: December 20, 1971-March 31, 1972*, (Karachi: Government of Pakistan, Department of Films and Publications, 1972), 9-12. Cited in Syed, *ibid.*, 118.
- 133 Stanley Kochanek, *Interest Groups and Development Business and Politics in Pakistan*, (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1983), 81.
- 134 Syed, *Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*, 121.
- 135 Kochanek, *Interest Groups and Development*, 80.
- 136 Ibid., 80-82.
- 137 Mustafa Kamal Pasha makes this observation in "Ncoliberal Recipe and Pakistan," *South Asia Journal*, 5 (July-September 2004).
- 138 Noman, *The Political Economy of Pakistan*, 161.
- 139 For a discussion of the tendency of democratic populists in Latin America to rely on mobilizing mass support, see Robert Dix, "Populism: Authoritarian and Democratic," *Latin American Research Review*, 20: 2, (1985), 29-52.
- 140 Schig Harrison, *India: The Most Dangerous Decades*, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1960).
- 141 Baldev Raj Nayar, *The Modernization Imperative and Indian Planning*, (New Delhi: Vikas, 1972).
- 142 Rounaq Jahan, *Pakistan: Failure in National Integration*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1972).
- 143 Despite less room for maneuver in the Pakistani budget, under the present adjustment program, fiscal deficits have been reduced more rapidly in Pakistan than in India.
- 144 Nehru, *Discovery of India*, 505.
- 145 Angus Maddison suggests a framework for such a comparative historical analysis. See "The Social Origins and Ideology of the Nationalist Movement" in his *Class Structure and Economic Growth*, 71-75.

### Organized labor and economic reform

- 1 Aron Purie, "Letter from the Editor," *Business Today*, (22 March-6 April 1992), 1. The cover story of the issue of the Indian business magazine is the "frenetic pace" of economic liberalization in Pakistan.
- 2 Moazzem Hossain, Iyanatul Islam, and Reza Kibria, *South Asian Economic Development: Transformation, Opportunities, and Challenges*, (London: Routledge, 1999), 109.
- 3 India's 1981 loan from the IMF, the institution's largest to that date, included structural adjustment features, but was made for balance of payment purposes and preceded the establishment of the IMF's Structural Adjustment Facility.
- 4 See John Harriss, "The State in Retreat? Why has India Experienced Such Half-Hearted 'Liberalisation' in the 1980s," *IDS Bulletin*, 18: 4, (October 1987), 31-38 and Atul Kohli, "Managing the economy: halfhearted liberalization," in Kohli, ed., *Democracy and Discontent: India's Growing Crisis of Governability*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 305-38. James Manor made a similar assessment in "Tried, then Abandoned: Economic Liberalization in India," *IDS Bulletin*, 18: 4, (October 1987), 39-44.
- 5 David Glover, "A Layman's Guide to Structural Adjustment," *Canadian Journal of Development Studies*, 13: 1, (1991), 173-86.

- 6 In Pakistan, social spending in real terms and as a proportion of total government expenditure initially shrunk between 1988 and 1991. Between 1991 and 1995, even as the economy grew at 4.5 percent, an additional 18 million people were forced into poverty. (Mahbub ul Haq, *Human Development in South Asia 1997*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press) 17. Haq reports an increase in the poverty rate over the period from 20 percent to 30 percent of the total population.) It is difficult to gauge the extent to which adjustment – distinct from other forces, such as the Gulf War and the associated decline in labor remittances – contributed to social and economic distress. For further discussion of the detrimental social impact of adjustment, see Walden Bello, with Shea Cunningham and Bill Rau, *Dark Victory: The United States, Structural Adjustment, and Global Poverty*, (London: Pluto Press, 1994)
- 7 W. Arthur Lewis, "Economic development with unlimited supplies of labour," *Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies*, 22: 2, (May 1954), 139–91 and Lewis, *The Theory of Economic Growth*, (London: Allen and Unwin, 1955).
- 8 On Friday, 13 August 1982, Jesus Silva Herzog, Mexico's Finance Minister, explained to officials in the US Federal Reserve Bank, the US Treasury, and the International Monetary Fund that the Government of Mexico would not meet its foreign debt payments. See Albert Fishlow, "Lessons from the Past: Capital Markets during the 19th Century and the Interwar Period," in Miles Kahler, ed., *The Politics of International Debt*, (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1986), 35.
- 9 For details on the economic and political crises surrounding Mrs. Gandhi's Emergency declaration, see chapter two.
- 10 A list of the points of the program appears in *Keesing's Contemporary Archives*, (6–12 October 1975), 27369–70.
- 11 The populist thrust and electoral logic of Mrs. Gandhi's economic policies after becoming Prime Minister in 1966 are discussed in greater detail in chapter two.
- 12 Manu Shroff, "Liberalisation of the Economy: The Indian Experience," *South Asia*, 1, (1990), 5.
- 13 Baldev Raj Nayar, *India's Mixed Economy: The Role of Ideology and Interest in its Development*, (Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1989), 341.
- 14 Government of India, Ministry of Industry, *Report 1977–78*, (New Delhi: Ministry of Industry, 1978), 268–84 cited in Nayar, op. cit., 342.
- 15 Sushil Khanna, interview with author, Indian Institute of Technology, Calcutta, 26 December 1991.
- 16 The US chose not to pursue this under the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) because, by GATT rules, countervailing duties on Indian imports would have required the US to show damage to US industries. Indian officials saw in this an attempt to punish India for its refusal to condemn the December 1979 Soviet intervention in Afghanistan.
- 17 The Bank explained that their decision to cancel the loan was reached because the Indian government had replaced the US firm C. F. Braun and Company with the Danish firm Haldor Topsoe, affiliated to Snam Progetti, as the consultants to the US\$812 million project. Under the agreement, the World Bank maintained the right to approve the consultants.
- 18 The lending rate was raised from 9 percent to 10 percent, while the minimum reserve rate was raised from 34 percent to 35 percent.
- 19 *Facts on File*, 1982, 38.
- 20 Ibid.
- 21 See Manmohan Singh, "1991–92 Budget Speech of Union Finance Minister Dr. Manmohan Singh," in Debendra Kumar Das, ed., *Structural Adjustment in the Indian Economy*, volume 2, (New Delhi: Deep and Deep Publications, 1993), 253–55.

- 22 A crore is equivalent to ten million rupees, or one hundred lakh (a lakh is one hundred thousand rupees).
- 23 Vijay Joshi and I. M. D. Little, "Macro-Economic Stabilization in India, 1991–93 and Beyond," *Economic and Political Weekly*, 28: 49, (December 4, 1993), 2659.
- 24 One hundred and thirty thousand Indian workers were employed in the Gulf at the time of the Iraqi invasion. The repatriation of these workers cost the government of India an estimated US\$200 million, while remittances lost totaled US\$205 million. Trade with Kuwait and Iraq worth US\$250 million was also lost. James Clad, "The IMF cometh," *Far Eastern Economic Review*, 153: 42, (October 18, 1990), 84.
- 25 A detailed analysis of the causes of the fiscal crisis is provided by Vijay Joshi and I. M. D. Little, *India: Macroeconomics and Political Economy, 1964–1991*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993). According to Joshi and Little, external shocks played a small role in the fiscal crisis.
- 26 These financial institutions included the State Bank of India, the State Bank of India Finance, the Industrial Credit and Investment Corporation of India, and the Oil and Natural Gas Commission. Clad, "The IMF cometh."
- 27 The Moody's Investor Service's report on India is discussed briefly by Sunanda Sen, "Dimensions of India's External Economic Crisis," *Economic and Political Weekly*, 29: 14, (April 2, 1994), 808.
- 28 "Privatization – Need for Checks and Balances," *Economic Review*, February 1, 1992, 7.
- 29 Anwar Syed, *The Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto*, (London: Macmillan, 1992), 122.
- 30 Shahid Zahid, *The Herald*, July 1988, 58.
- 31 Omar Ashgar Khan, "Impact of Foreign Aid on Economic Development," in Viqar Ahmed and Rashid Amjad, *The Management of Pakistan's Economy*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1984), 303.
- 32 International Monetary Fund, *1991 IMF Annual Report*, (Washington, DC: IMF, 1991), 51.
- 33 *Keesing's Record of World Events*, 34: 10, (October 1988), 36219.
- 34 Economist Intelligence Unit (hereafter EIU), *Pakistan, Afghanistan, 4/1988*, (October 31, 1988), 12.
- 35 Sayed Wajid, Chief Economist, Pakistan Desk, IMF, interview with author, July 15, 1992.
- 36 This paragraph and the following is informed by *Keesing's Record of World Events*, 35: 12, (December 1989), 37151.
- 37 EIU, *Pakistan, Afghanistan, 2/1989*, (May 10, 1989), 12.
- 38 EIU, *Pakistan, Afghanistan, 4/1988*, (October 31, 1988), 2. The rate of exchange is for 24 October 1988.
- 39 EIU, *Pakistan, Afghanistan, 4/1989*, (October 23, 1989), 2. The rate of exchange is for 16 October 1989.
- 40 EIU, *Pakistan, Afghanistan, 2/1990*, (April 6, 1990), 3. The rate of exchange on 4 April 1990 was Rs. 21.49 to US\$1.
- 41 EIU, *Pakistan, Afghanistan, 4/1990*, (October 25, 1990), 17.
- 42 Sayed Wajid, interview with author, July 15, 1992.
- 43 Under Nawaz Sharif, foreign exchange regulations were amended so that, unlike India, any individual could hold bank accounts in foreign exchange. Eleven new private sector commercial banks were approved and 49 mutual funds (modarba companies) were allowed to operate in the Karachi Stock Exchange.
- 44 According to an IMF official, no negotiations were initiated before Sharif's government was dismissed and the interim government of Moeen Qureshi initiated its radical reforms. Sayed Wajid, interview with author, 15 July 1992.
- 45 Sayed Wajid, interview with author, July 15, 1992.

- 46 World Bank, "Pakistan: Country Economic Memorandum FY93: Progress Under the Adjustment Program," (Washington, DC: World Bank, March 23, 1993), 49.
- 47 "Qadir outlines package for employees," *Dawn Business Review*, August 20, 1991. Qadir was later arrested and jailed, charged with bribe-taking during his tenure as Chairman of the Privatization Commission. It is interesting that the Privatization Commission spells its name with a "z" in accordance with American usage rather than with an "s" which is standard in Pakistan.
- 48 World Bank, "Pakistan: Country Economic Memorandum FY93," 51.
- 49 Amir Mir, "Pakistan-Labor: Privatization Increases Labor Woes," Interpress Services, May 14, 1995.
- 50 This and the next paragraph are informed by Mohammad Ishaque, President, Pak China Fertilizer Mazdoor Union, interview with author, Rawalpindi December 5, 1995.
- 51 This did not dissuade one of the four brothers who run the Schon group from loaning to Benazir Bhutto a helicopter for use in her 1993 election campaign.
- 52 Cheryl McQueen, "Pakistan: A Bold Agenda for Economic Reform," *Business America*, 113: 1, (January 13, 1992), 8.
- 53 Naved Ahmed, Experts Advisory Cell, interview with author, Islamabad February 9, 1992.
- 54 This is according to IMF Resident Representative Harry Snoeq. "IMF supports Govt's economic policies," *Dawn*, (September 29, 1993), i, iv.
- 55 EIU, *Pakistan/Afghanistan*, 2/1994, (June 8, 1994), 9.
- 56 EIU, *Pakistan/Afghanistan*, 4/1994, (November 25, 1994), 21.
- 57 EIU, *Pakistan/Afghanistan*, 2/1994, (June 8, 1994), 9 and EIU, *Pakistan/Afghanistan*, 4/1994, (November 25, 1994), 22.
- 58 Salman Zahid, interview with author, Islamabad, 7 November 1995.
- 59 EIU, *Pakistan/Afghanistan*, 4/1994, (November 25, 1994), 30.
- 60 *Ibid.*, 34.
- 61 "Six oil wells, new gas finds to be privatized," *Dawn Wire Service*, (May 22, 1999).
- 62 Workers Education Research and Welfare Society, "Nijkari ke sub Pakhtunkhwa aur mazdooron par asrat," ["The privatization of the entire Pakhtun nation and its effect on workers"] Peshawar: WERWS.
- 63 Senior World Bank Economist for India, interview with author, Washington, DC, July 17, 1992.
- 64 Perry Anderson, "The Limits and Possibilities of Trade Union Action," in Robin Blackburn and Alexander Cockburn, eds, *The Incompatibles*, (London: Penguin, 1967), 264.
- 65 See further Christopher Candland, "The Political Element in Economic Reform: Labor Institutions and Privatization Patterns in South Asia," in Linda Cook and Marsha Pripstein Posusney, eds, *Labor and Privatization: Responses and Consequences in Global Perspective*, (Brookfield: Edward Elgar, 2002).
- 66 Claims here are based on a number of conversations in October 1991, November 1991, and January 1993 with R. K. Bhakt, General Secretary, Bharatiya Mazdoor Sangh; G. K. Bhardwaj, Centre for Indian Trade Unions; Homi Daji, General Secretary of the All India Trade Union Congress; and S. N. Rao, Secretary, Indian National Trade Union Congress.
- 67 Ramamurthy resigned in protest not against the government's labor policies but over the federal government's position in a water dispute involving Karnataka and his home state of Tamil Nadu. International Labour Office, "India: Tripartite Cooperation for Structural Adjustment," *Social and Labour Bulletin*, (June, 1992), 143-45.
- 68 "Let the Workers Take Over," *Business India*, (January 13, 1992).

- 69 This perspective on the Tripartite Committee meetings is informed by an interview with a labor representative at the meetings, including Damodar Thankapan, Director, Centre for Workers' Management and former Working President, Kamani Employees Union, interview with author, New Delhi, March 22, 1992, and on the memorandum in question, Government of India, Ministry of Coal, "A Record Note of the First Meeting of the Special Tripartite Committee held in Bombay on 21.12.1991 at 10.00 am under the Chairmanship of Shri P. A. Sangma, Minister of State for Coal," mimeograph, n.d. The deliberations of the meeting were conveyed to the conference of state labor ministers on February 6, 1992, reported in ILO, "India: Tripartite Cooperation for Structural Adjustment."
- 70 S. N. Rao, Secretary, Indian National Trade Union Congress, interview with author, New Delhi, 15 December 1995.
- 71 C. R. Bakshi, "Bailadila Privatisation," *Trade Union Record*, (October 20 and November 5, 1995), 35-36.
- 72 Teesta Setalvad, "Workers Mean Business," *Business India*, (July 6-19, 1992), 99-100.
- 73 "9 killed in U.P. Firing on Workers," *Times of India*, (June 4, 1991).
- 74 "RS Call for Probe into U.P. Firing," *Times of India*, (June 5, 1991).
- 75 T. N. Siddhanta, "Brutal Killings at Dalla Cement Factory," (New Delhi: AITUC Publication, August 1991).
- 76 Subashini Ali, Communist Party of India Member of Parliament from Kanpur district, interview with author, Kanpur, December 22, 1991.
- 77 See Sharat G. Lin, "Shankar Guha Niyogi: Beyond Conventional Trade Unionism," *Bulletin of Concerned Asia Scholars*, 24: 3, (July-September 1992), 16-25.
- 78 Narayanan Madhavan, "India: Indian Mining Plan Draws Opposition Ire," Reuters News Service, (March 31, 1996).
- 79 "Landmarks," *Business India*, (August 14-27, 1995), 32.
- 80 Bakshi, "Bailadila Privatisation."
- 81 "Landmarks."
- 82 Scandal broke when Himachal Futuristics Communications, in a consortium with Israel's Bezeq and Thailand's Shinwarta, was awarded licenses for 9 of the 21 basic service zones. The Minister of Communications, Sukh Ram, was accused of favoritism in selecting Himachal Futuristics, which is based in the Minister's home state of Himachal Pradesh and successfully bid US\$24 billion for the nine zones, despite having revenues of only US\$57 million.
- 83 Amita Verma, "Workshop on Exit Policy for Sick Industrial Undertakings," report prepared for the Federation of Indian Chambers of Commerce and Industry, (December 1991), 1.
- 84 Hari Ramachandran, "India shuns labour reforms to stall unemployment," Reuters, (March 9, 1994).
- 85 V. P. Sawney, comments before Federation of Indian Chambers of Commerce and Industry's Workshop on Exit Policy for Sick Industrial Undertakings, New Delhi, (December 4, 1991). With these utterances, and with sufficient intervals and attempts at reconciliation, a Muslim may declare divorce.
- 86 Sickness in Indian industry has consumed Rs. 9,353 crore (US\$6.235 billion) of public funds as of 1989. See "More private units falling sick: panel," *Times of India*, July 19, 1993.
- 87 V. S. Kaveri and Megha Bhalerao, *Sick Industrial Companies Act*, (Delhi: Ajanta, 1991), 17.
- 88 Steve Talbot, World Bank Economist for India, interview with author, Washington, DC July 15, 1992. BIFR officials interviewed in New Delhi noted that World Bank officials had come from Bank headquarters to examine the operation of the BIFR, review proposals for its reform, and interview BIFR officials.

- 89 Richard Cambridge, World Bank Economist for India, interview with author, Washington, DC July 17, 1992.
- 90 R. Ganapathy, Chairperson of the BIFR, FICCI Workshop on Exit Policy for Sick Industrial Undertakings, interview with the author New Delhi, 4 December 1991.
- 91 Section 3. Government of India, *Industrial Disputes Act of 1947*, (Bombay: Labour Law Agency, 1987).
- 92 Tiwari *et al.*, *Report of the Committee to Examine the Legal and Other Difficulties Faced by Banks and Financial Institutions in Rehabilitation of Sick Industrial Undertakings and Suggest Remedial Measures Including Changes in the Law*, (Bombay: Reserve Bank of India, 1984), 25-27.
- 93 Khurshid Ahmed, General Secretary, APFTU, interview with author, Lahore, September 3, 1992.
- 94 Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, *State of Human Rights in Pakistan 1990*, (Lahore: HRCP, 1990), 50.
- 95 The minimum wage is not sufficient to meet minimum living standards for a small family.
- 96 Mohamunad Yaqoob, Chairman, APSEWAC, interview with author, March 29, 1992. The agreement was well covered by the press. See "Workers offered three packages," *Dawn*, October 16, 1991, "Govt, workers reach agreement," *Business Recorder*, October 16, 1991 and "Safeguarding workers' interest," *Business Recorder*, October 25, 1991.
- 97 A. R. Kemal, Member and Chief Economist, Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan, interview with author, November 29, 1995.
- 98 *Dawn News Service*, "Dishonest Staff in LBs: IBRD Threatens to Stop Aid to Punjab," February 13, 1995.
- 99 Syed Hameeduddin, "Workers Protest Labor Leader's Arrest," Karachi: Mimeograph, September 1992.
- 100 Syed Hameduddin, "Government Exempts Daewoo from Labor Laws," (Karachi: mimeograph, September 1992).
- 101 The APFTU represents both public sector and private sector enterprises, of which the Water and Power Development Authority State Hydroelectric Labour Union (WAPDA SHLU) is central. Khurshid Ahmed is General Secretary of the WAPDA SHLU and the APFTU.
- 102 Khurshid Ahmed, interview with author, September 3, 1992.
- 103 EIU, "Outlook: A Tough Budget is in Prospect," May 31, 1995.
- 104 EIU, Views Wire, "Pakistan Investment: Power Plant Sell-Off Spurs Violence," May 10, 1995.
- 105 Khurshid Ahmed, interview with author, Lahore, December 8, 1995.
- 106 Amir Mir, "Pakistan-Labor: Privatization Increases Labor Woes," *Interpress Services*, May 14, 1995.

### Reorganizing industry, disorganizing workers

- 1 E. Balakrishnan, "Presidential Address to the Working Committee Meeting (annual) of the All India Trade Union Congress," November 2, 1995 (Bhilai), in *The Working Class*, 25: 4, (December 1995), New Delhi: AITUC, 5-6.
- 2 Government of India, Ministry of Labour, *Indian Labour Yearbook, 2004*.
- 3 Government of Pakistan, *Pakistan Labour Gazette: A Journal of Labour Affairs* (Karachi: The Manager of Publications, 1995), 130.
- 4 See, for example, Sujata Gothoskar, "Managerial Strategies in the 1990s and the Case for Evolving New Union Strategies," (Bombay: Workers' Solidarity Centre, 1991).

- 5 Sec, for example, Isher Judge Ahluwalia, "Trade Policy and Industrialisation in India," (Bombay: Exim Bank of India, 1992), 6, 17.
- 6 Sec "India: How to Keep Out Investors," *Economist*, June 11, 1994, 34 and Kaushik Basu, "Why India Needs Labor Law Reform" *BBC News*, June 27, 2005.
- 7 The Provincial Directorates of Labour in Pakistan, which submit figures to the central government, do not distinguish between strikes and lockouts.
- 8 Satyanarayan Jatiya, Minister of Labour, in answer to question number 852 in the Rajya Sabha on 7 December 1998.
- 9 Sahib Singh Verma, Minister of Labour, answer to unstarred question number 1812, in the Rajya Sabha on 18 December 2003.
- 10 International Labour Office, *Employment, Incomes and Equality: A Strategy for Increasing Productive Employment in Kenya*, (Geneva: ILO, 1972).
- 11 *Ibid.*
- 12 John Harriss, K. P. Kannan and Gerry Rodgers, *Urban Labour Market Structure and Job Access in India: A Study of Coimbatore*, (Geneva: International Institute for Labour Studies, 1990). The study is based on a survey of 200 households in a south Indian industrial city.
- 13 This section is largely informed by the collection of articles published in *Labour File: A Monthly Journal of Labour and Economic Affairs*: 6: 8 and 9, (August-September 2000), edited by J. John.
- 14 Sindhu Menon, "The Relentless Struggle of Rickshaw Pullers," *Labour File*, 6: 8 and 9, (August-September 2000), 3.
- 15 Vishnu Shukla, "Rickshaw: A Convenient Conveyance," *Labour File*, 6: 8 and 9, (August-September 2000), 14.
- 16 Menon, "Relentless Struggle," 9.
- 17 *Ibid.*, 4.
- 18 *Ibid.*, 5.
- 19 *Ibid.*, 6.
- 20 *Ibid.*, 7.
- 21 C. P. Gupta, interviewed by Menon, "The Relentless Struggle of Rickshaw Pullers."
- 22 Shukla, "A Convenient Conveyance," 13.
- 23 Arbind Singh, "Rickshaw to the Puller," *Labour File*, 6: 8 and 9, (August-September 2000), 17.
- 24 Fasihuk Karim Siddiqi, "Identification of the Problems and Prospects of Contract Labour in Pakistan (Employers' Point of View)," paper presented to the National Institute of Labour Administration and Training/Friedrich Ebert Stiftung National Seminar on Contract Labour, May 25-26, 1992, mimeograph, 3.
- 25 Zulaekha Zar, "Contract Labour," paper presented to the National Institute of Labour Administration and Training/Friedrich Ebert Stiftung National Seminar on Contract Labour, May 25-26, 1992, mimeograph, 14.
- 26 Colin Gonsalvez, interview with author, Mumbai, 21 February 1993.
- 27 Lok Sabha unstarred Question No. 7584, addressed by Shri Kashiram Rana, answered by Deputy Minister of Labour, Shri Paban Singh Ghatowar, April 22, 1992.
- 28 Colin Gonsalvez, interview with author, Mumbai, February 21, 1993.
- 29 Zar, "Contract Labour," 1992, 7. Dr. Zar's paper includes a lengthy list of labor laws which specify that work on contract is legally considered to be formal employment.
- 30 Fasihuk Karim Siddiqi, "Identification of the Problems and Prospects of Contract Labour in Pakistan (Employers' Point of View)." A. Khan, interview with author, Karachi, August 25, 1992.
- 31 Mukhtar Farooq, "The Textile Sector - An Employer's View," in Qutubuddin Aziz, ed., *Working Conditions in the Textile Industry in Pakistan*, (Karachi: Pakistan Media Corporation, 1992), 37.

- 32 *Business Recorder*, June 20, 1970.
- 33 "No Textiles from Pakistan: UK for 2-Month Moratorium," *Pakistan Times*, March 20, 1972.
- 34 "British Textile Embargo a Political Decision," *Business Recorder*, April 4, 1972.
- 35 "World Cotton Textile Agreement," *Business Recorder*, 20 June 1970, 4.
- 36 Industrial Research Service, *Cotton Textile Industry in Pakistan*, (Karachi: Economic and Industrial Publications, 1990), 79.
- 37 David Morris, *The Emergence of an Industrial Labor Force in India: A Study of the Bombay Cotton Mills, 1854-1947*, (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1965), 17.
- 38 Millowners' Association, "Facts about the Cotton Mill Industry of India," (Bombay: Millowners' Association, 1953), 1.
- 39 Baldev Raj Nayar, *India's Mixed Economy: The Role of Ideology and Interest in Its Development*, (Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1989), 309-14.
- 40 Government of India, Ministry of Law, Justice and Company Affairs, "The Sick Textile Undertakings (Nationalisation) Act, 1974," (No. 57 of 1974), (Gangtok: Government of India Press, 1984).
- 41 "The Sick Textile Undertakings (Nationalisation) Act, 1974," Art. 29; Ministry of Law, *The Constitution of India*, (New Delhi: Government of India Press, 1967), 26.
- 42 From Kotwal Committee Report, 1987, 22. Cited by Hubert van Wersch, *Bombay Textile Strike 1982-83*, (Bombay: Oxford University Press, 1992), 236.
- 43 Ajeet Mathur, "The Experience of Consultation during Structural Adjustment in India (1990-92)," *International Labour Review* 132: 3, (1993), 331-45.
- 44 Indian Cotton Mills' Federation, *Handbook of Statistics on Cotton Textile Industry*, (Bombay: Indian Cotton Mills' Federation, 1993), 9.
- 45 *Kothari's Industrial Directory of India, 1990*, (Madras: Kothari Enterprises, 1990), 15.
- 46 Millowners' Association, "Facts about the Cotton Mill Industry of India," 8. Ramnath Podar, *The Indian Cotton Mill Industry: Nation's Premier Enterprise*, (Bombay: Podar Trading Company, 1959), 15.
- 47 Ajay Piramal, "Much depends on exit policy," *Business India 15th Anniversary Issue*, 1993, 284.
- 48 Hariben Naik, President of Rashtriya Mill Mazdoor Sangh, interview with author, Mumbai April 20, 1992.
- 49 van Wersch, *The Bombay Textile Strike*, 380-88.
- 50 Mahesh Vijapurkar, "Steps to check criminalisation of textile unions," *The Hindu* (International Edition), 20: 43, (October 22, 1994), 12.
- 51 This section is informed by van Wersch, *The Bombay Textile Strike 1982-83*, 95-100.
- 52 Hariben Naik, President of Rashtriya Mill Mazdoor Sangh, interview with author, Mumbai April 20, 1992.
- 53 Van Wersch's study on the strike is reviewed by Bagaram Tulpule, "Bombay Textile Strike," *Economic and Political Weekly*, January 16-23, 1993, 101-103. Also see Salim Lakha, "Organized Labor and Militant Unionism: The Bombay Textile Workers' Strike of 1982," *Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars*, 20: 2, April-June 1988, 42-53 and Bharat Patankar, "The Bombay Textile Workers' Strike of 1982: The Lessons of History," *Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars*, 20: 2, April-June 1988, 54-56.
- 54 van Wersch, *Bombay Textile Strike*, 97.
- 55 Rajni Bakshi, "The Legacy of a Marathon Struggle," *The Hindu*, September 20, 1992.
- 56 van Wersch, *Bombay Textile Strike*, 45.

- 57 Indian National Textile Workers' Federation and Ambekar Institute for Labour Studies, "Problems of Powerloom Industry in India: A Trade Union Point of View," (Brussels: International Textile, Garment and Leather Workers' Federation, 1984), 6.
- 58 Before the communal disturbances of December 1992 and February 1993 drove Muslim workers out of Surat, one trade union study estimated that over a hundred weavers migrated to Surat for work every day. Indian National Textile Workers Federation and Ambekar Institute for Labour Studies, "Problems of Powerloom Industry in India: A Trade Union Point of View," mimeograph, (October 1984) 13.
- 59 Nandika Jaitely, "The Triumph and the Tragedy," *Business India*, (March 19-April 1, 1990), 138-40.
- 60 Omkar Goswami, "Sickness and Growth of India's Textile Industry, Analysis and Policy Options," *Economic and Political Weekly*, November 10, 1990, 2429-2439 and 2496-2505.
- 61 L. C. Jain, "1985 Textile Policy. End of Handloom Industry," *Economic and Political Weekly*, July 6, 1985, 1121-1123.
- 62 Sharat G. Lin, "Delhi Textile Strike: Implication of Linking Wages to Productivity," *Economic and Political Weekly*, August 30, 1986, M85-M92.
- 63 Praful Bidwai, Senior Correspondent, Times of India, conversation with author, New Delhi, January 9, 1992.
- 64 "PM to Convene Special Meet on Textile Policy Soon," *Economic Times*, April 13, 1992.
- 65 See further Asha Krishnakumar, "Weavers in Distress," *Frontline*, 18: 8, (April 2001) 14-27.
- 66 Industrial Research Service, *Cotton Textile Industry in Pakistan*, 1-2.
- 67 Shahid Javed Burki, "Cotton Industry's New Importance," mimeograph, April 1972.
- 68 Khalimullah Khan, "Growth of Pakistan's Textile Industry - A Trade Union's View," mimeograph, 1992, 40.
- 69 Ahmed Rashid, "Easier Said: Pakistan shows how divisive deregulation can be," *Far Eastern Economic Review*, June 2, 1994, 54.
- 70 Azhar Lari, "Mills One-day Closure to Cut Yarn Output," *The Muslim*, August 3, 1992, 9.
- 71 Shahid-Ur Rehman, "Textile Crisis Needs a Nationalistic Solution," *Pakistan and Gulf Economist*, 10-11 April, 1993, 8.
- 72 *Ibid.*, 8-9.
- 73 "Industrialists demand ban on strikes," *Business Recorder*, 17 January, 1972, 1.
- 74 The All Pakistan Textile Mills Association report of 1987-88 reports that approximately 100,000 looms are operating in the informal sector. Shabbir Kazmi estimates that the number is more likely 150,000 looms. Shabbir Kazmi, "Charting the Progress of the Textile Industry," *Dawn*, September 5, 1992.
- 75 Khalimullah Khan, "Growth of Pakistan's Textile Industry: A Trade Union's View," mimeograph, 1992, 41.
- 76 Guisinger and Irfan estimate that 69.1 percent of the total Pakistan labor force is in the informal sector. Stephen Guisinger and Mohammad Irfan, "Pakistan's Informal Sector," *Journal of Development Studies*, 16, (1980) 413.
- 77 On Fordism and flexibilization see Alain Lipietz, *Mirages and Miracles: The Crisis of Global Fordism*, trans. D. Marcey, (London: Verso Press, 1987).

### Organized labor, democracy, and development

- 1 Bagaram Tulpule, "Bombay Textile Strike," *Economic and Political Weekly*, 28: 3 and 4, (January 16-23, 1993), 103. Tulpule is a senior leader in the Hind Mazdoor Sabha.

- 2 See, for example, John Weeks, "The Myth of Labour Market Clearing," in Guy Standing and Vietor Tokman, eds, *Toward Social Adjustment: Labor Market Issues in South Asia*, (Geneva: International Labour Office, 1991), 53-77 and Truman Bewely, *Why Wages Don't Fall During a Recession*, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999).
- 3 For a brief overview of the debate on poverty estimates in India, see "On New Poverty Estimates," *Economic and Political Weekly*, 42: 13, March 31, 2007, 1067-68.
- 4 Estimates are for 1999-2000.
- 5 Kothari, "The Politics of Planning," paper delivered to Jawaharlal Nehru University, 13 November 1991.
- 6 This is a major argument of Zafar Shaheed's "The Organisation and Leadership of Industrial Labour in Pakistan (Karachi)", unpublished PhD dissertation, Department of Politics, University of Leeds, 1977. Oxford University Press Karachi will publish the work in 2007.
- 7 Amir Mir, "Pakistan-Labor: Privatization Increases Labor Woes," Interpress Services, (May 14, 1995): National Centre for Labour, 2486.
- 8 Mohan Mani, "New Attempt at Workers' Resistance: National Centre for Labour," *Economic and Political Weekly*, (October 7, 1995), 2486.
- 9 For a largely quantitative assessment of whether union multiplicity leads to union quiescence (the involuted pluralism thesis of Lloyd Rudolph and Susanne Rudolph, *In Pursuit of Lakshmi*, 1985), see Emmanuel Teitelbaum, "Was the Indian Labour Movement Really Coopted: Evaluating Standard Accounts," *Critical Asian Studies*, 38: 4, (December 2006).
- 10 Nagarik Mancha (Citizen's Forum), *Against the Wall: West Bengal Labour Scenario*, (Calcutta: Spokesman, 1991).
- 11 See Sindhu Menon, "The Relentless Struggle of Rickshaw Pullers," *Labour File*, 6: 8 and 9, (August-September 2000), 9.
- 12 Interview with author, Sanjay Singhvi, Mumbai High Court Mumbai labor advocate, December 15, 1995, Mumbai.
- 13 Mani, "New Attempt at Workers' Resistance," 2486.
- 14 The other founding member organizations are the Sarva Shramik Sangh, Aaganwadi Karanchari Sangh, Kamani Employees Union, Ibrahim Pattinam Telugu Vyvasaya Coolie Sangam, Gujarat State Women's Cooperative Federation, Agricultural Labour Union of Gujarat, Construction Labour Union of Ahmedabad, Women's Voice, Rice, Oil Mill and General Workers Union, Cotton Mills Workers Union of Bellary, Mines and Mineral Processing Workers Union, APMC Hamali Sangha, Shramik Samitli of Kanpur, Bangalore Gruha Karmikara Sangh, Samajwadi Mazdoor Panehayat, Nirman Mazdoor Pan-chayat Sangham, and Ghjed Khatna Mazdoor Morcha of Saharanpu.
- 15 National Centre for Labour pamphlet, no date.
- 16 Renana Jhabvala, former General Secretary, Self-Employed Women's Association, letter to N. P. Samy, Convenor, National Centre for Labour, January 16, 1997 and M. Arunchalam (Labour Minister), "Design Protection Measures for Unorganized Labour," in *V. V. Giri National Labour Institute Newsletter*, (August-September 1996), 1-5. See also Supriya Roy Chowdhury, "Old Classes and New Spaces: Urban Poverty, Unorganized Labor and New Unions," *Economic and Political Weekly*, December 13, 2003.
- 17 "National Council (sic) of Labour to Launch Agitation," *The Pioneer*, (Kanpur), (June 26, 1995), 3.
- 18 Kerri Danskin, "Made In India; Made in Thailand," *Clamor*, May/June 2003, 59.
- 19 "SEWA Under Attack," November 2, 2005, *Labor Start*, [www.labourstart.org/docs/en/000209.html](http://www.labourstart.org/docs/en/000209.html).

- 20 See Elisabeth Prügl, *The Global Construction of Gender: Home-Based Work in the Political Economy of the 20th Century*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999).
- 21 Renana Jhabvala "Liberalization and Women," *Seminar*, 531, (Footloose Labour: A Symposium on Livelihood Struggles of the Informal Workforce), November 2003.
- 22 For a discussion of the rise of independent unionism in Bombay, see E. A. Ramaswamy, "Bombay," *Worker Consciousness and Trade Union Response*, (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1988), 17-78. Also see Paul Kurian and Amrita Chhachhi, "New Phase in Textile Unionism?" *Economic and Political Weekly*, February 20, 1982; Bharat Patankar, "The Bombay Textile Workers' Strike of 1982: The Lessons of History," *Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars*, 20: 2, April-June 1988, 54-56; Debashish Bhattacharjee, 'Union-Type, Labor Market Structure, and Bargaining Outcomes in Indian Manufacturing: An Analysis of the New Unionism in Greater Bombay', unpublished PhD dissertation in Labor and Industrial Relations, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign, 1987, cf. 197 on the origins and effects of independent unionism in Bombay in the early 1970s and the subsequent formation of the Kamgar Aghadi Party.
- 23 MLF, "Muttahida Labour Federation: An Introduction," mimeograph, May 1992.
- 24 PILER, "Trade Union Leadership Development Course," mimeograph, February 1989.
- 25 MLF, "Muttahida Labour Federation: An Introduction," mimeograph, May 1992.
- 26 These federations were the United Workers' Federation, the Democratic Labour Federation, the Joint Labour Federation, the Baluchistan Labour Federation, and the Watan Dost Mazdoor Federation.
- 27 MLF, "Muttahida Labour Federation: An Introduction," mimeograph, May 1992.
- 28 Farhat Parveen and Karamat Ali, "Research in Action: Organising Women Factory Workers in Pakistan," in Amrita Chhachhi and Renée Ilene Pitkin, eds, *Confronting State, Capital and Patriarchy: Women Organizing in the Process of Industrialization*, (New York: St. Martins Press, 1996).
- 29 Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research, *Unfree Labour in Pakistan: Work, Debt and Bondage in Brick Kilns*, (Geneva: International Labour Office, March 2004).
- 30 Beena Sarwar, "Pakistan: Greens to Blockade Import of Danish Ship," Interpress Services, November 15, 1994.
- 31 A "scheduled" employment refers to occupations designated and incorporated in legislation.
- 32 Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency, *Understanding Labour Issues in Pakistan*, Briefing Paper for Pakistani Parliamentarians, 2002.
- 33 Unorganized Sector Workers' Social Security Bill, 2005.
- 34 Christopher Candland and Rudra Sil, eds, *The Politics of Labor in a Global Age: Continuity and Change in Late-industrializing and Post-socialist Economies*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001).